

CHAPTER 5

Conclusion, Discussion, and Recommendations

This research had 2 main objectives, namely, 1) to develop the curriculum for the course science and art for happiness creation basing on contemplative education for Chiang Mai University undergraduate students, and, 2) to study the effect of using the developed curriculum by focusing on learning reflection of the learners while implementing the course, the students' happiness, their satisfaction, and other opinion and feeling of them after using the curriculum. The research process was operated in 3 phases:

Phase 1 : Studying the context of the problem and the needs for the curriculum development, reviewing the related literatures to realize the problem conditions, needs, and feasibility of the curriculum development, and carrying out the process of asking for the permission to offer the course, and setting up the principle and curriculum components, and synthesizing the draft curriculum, as follows:

- 1) Studying the problem conditions and needs for the curriculum development
- 2) Surveying and studying the courses offered by faculties or in states under Chiang Mai University and other universities, particularly those in the category of general education.
- 3) Studying the documents on Thai Qualification Framework for Higher Education to set up the framework and guideline for documenting the curriculum.
- 4) Study touring and participating in variety of programs including the exchange with the knowledgeable persons or academics concerned with contemplative education and happiness development to be used as the framework and guideline for developing the curriculum contents.
- 5) Synthesizing the drafted curriculum by setting the scope of objectives and the curriculum contents.

Phase 2: Completing the curriculum development covering the contents and specific objectives for the curriculum, instructional media which were B various, the design of instruction either in the classroom, by E-Learning, and out of school. The particular attention was paid for planning the instruction to fit the contents, objectives, and expected outcome of the curriculum and learning outcomes to be achieved by the learners. And quality of the curriculum was checked by experts before implementing it.

Phase 3: Implementing the curriculum and evaluating the curriculum using. This phase was to implement the curriculum which had passed the quality check with the sample of undergraduate students in Chiang Mai University and evaluating the curriculum at the end of all instructions.

5.1 Research Conclusion - The conclusion was based on the 2 main research objectives as follows:

5.1.1 The Developed Curriculum – This was the curriculum on the course Science and Art for Happiness Creation basing on contemplative education for undergraduate students, Chiang Mai University, which was developed based on TABA's 7 steps along Thai Qualifications Framework for Higher Education (TQF:HEd). Finally It was approved since second semester, 2012 academic year, and opens the course in every regular semester. The course appeared in the database of the Registration Office as 571151: *Science and Art for Happiness Creation* which was a general education course, with 3 credit units [3 (2-2-5)]. The course was composed of 2 credit units for theory taking 30 hours and 1 credit unit of practicum taking 30 hours.

The researcher had organized the instructional activities for theoretical part in forms of E-Learning on CMU Online system using KC-MOODLE and used the Facebook to present all the information, documents, and instructional media. After that, he organized classroom activities utilizing 5 techniques of contemplative education and set 8 sessions for classroom learning and 7 sessions for online real time. The sample used for the research was of 51 students from 4 faculties who were enrolled in this course. In the week prior to the final exam, he researcher had led the group to engage in a practicum at Wat Pha Lad

(Sakathakhami) under the program entitled “*Train the Mind to Create Happiness*” which was the practice of happiness creation through intellectual development. The training took time on Saturday and Sunday taking 2 continuous days. The students stayed over night at the temple for one night. All these were mainly responsible by the researcher with Phra Ajarn and male trainer helped to serve as the resource persons in lecturing the Dhamma, train on the conscious maintenance, and practice meditation, as well as the evening and morning prays.

5.1.2 Effects of Using the Curriculum – It was found that during weeks 1 and 3 of the classroom activities using the 5 techniques of contemplative education, the learners had not been able to perfectly master the 5 techniques. When approaching the 5th week, most learners (more than 80% 80) could well practice them. This was evaluated from the learning reflection which was the last technique practiced by the learners right away after the end of the instruction. The learners could have the reflected submitted through CMU Online. In such reflection, the learners could write to reflect on what had been learned quite well, particularly when outside practice on the period of week 14-15 was concerned on which the learners reflected that the practice was good and useful. They could stay attaching to the calm enhancing their conscious, calming happiness and intelligence and though they could apply all knowledge and experiences in their everyday life.

For the sample’s average score of happiness before and after using curriculum, it was found that they did not substantively differ. Mean score before being taught by the curriculum was 114.80 and after mean score after that was 115.18 which was only 0.38 higher. When considering by item, however, when each item was analyzed, it was found that there were 18 items whose happiness mean score was higher after than before the using the curriculum though the difference was minimal. There were 4 items whose mean scores were higher than before using the curriculum with statistical significance ($p < .05$).

Regarding the satisfaction with the learner of the sample, it was found that the mean score of satisfaction in general was at high level. When each aspect was concerned, it was found that they all were at high level and up. The mean score on the aspects of having opportunity to progress and relationship with the classmates were at very high level. Considering satisfaction with the learning in all aspects, it was found that most students, or more than 72.55%, had satisfaction at high level to the highest level. In the aspect of having opportunity for progress, most of the learners, or 100% of them, had the satisfaction at high to highest levels.

Concerning the effect of using the curriculum, the learners had responded in the evaluative form at the end of the instruction both on theory and outside practice and after the final test. The learners sent the information to the researcher via E-mail. The information had indicated the sample's happiness and satisfaction with the learning after the use of the curriculum. It was found that their evaluative reflections were plentiful and various and could be concluded in 5 parts, namely, 1) opinion and feeling of the sample on the content of the curriculum, 2) opinion and feeling the sample on the instructional process and method, 3) opinion and feeling of the sample on the lecturer and resource persons, 4) opinion and feeling of the sample on the course as a whole, and, 5) notes and recommendations for this course's instruction. From the evaluative reflection in general, it could be concluded that the learners had good attitude toward the course from acquiring the knowledge and good experiences, having no stress from the study, the course's applicability in their everyday life, and happiness from the learning.

5.2 Discussion

The researcher would discuss the research along the two research objectives, that is, to develop the curriculum on science and art for happiness creation basing on contemplative education for the undergraduate students, Chiang Mai University, and to study the effect of using developed course curriculum, discussion were as follows:

5.2.1 Curriculum Development on the Course – Science and Art for Happiness Creation Based on Contemplative Education for Bachelor Degree Students, Chiang Mai University

Developing for this course based on Taba's 7 steps along Thai Qualifications Framework for Higher Education (TQF:HEd). Finally It was approved by academic committee, Chiang Mai University. The step that took the longest time was the literature review and feasibility study of the curriculum development of the course. This step was important as it needed to satisfy the needs of the society and the learners. The content of the course had to not overlap with the existing courses. The results of the study reveal that such course had not overlapped with the existing courses. The new course was one of the general education categories. This was because the contents of the course were relevant to general education and contemplative education. The general education courses were to make the students the perfect humanity. It had to be taught in an integrative way with variety of instructional activities, such as lecture, discussion, engaging in the activities, and learning through authentic situations (Duangduen, Churairat, 2008, and, Wasi, Prawase, 2008). The main principle of contemplative education was the learning with reflection focusing on the learning process which was not static but dynamic. Contemplative education believed also that every human had the capacity to learn with reflection but there was a need to set up the environments to facilitate learning which was congruent with the Pali term *Suppaya* (Haynes, 2005, and, Panich, Wijak, 2008). Besides, contemplative education could also help the learners to learn in an integrated or interdisciplinary way enabling them to combine and integrate various disciplines to process the knowledge to answer the question, problem, or phenomenon in a complete way. They would not segregate the problem or phenomenon. It would also develop the learner's mind and intelligence in a holistic way making him/her the well-balanced and perfect human (Contemplative Education Center, 2009, and Asdornnithee, Somsit, 2009).

Regarding the learning outcome expected to occur with the learners prescribed in the developed curriculum focused on moral learning which was very crucial. To produce the graduates with the desirable characteristics – having knowledge and competency along with morality, the process had to facilitate the learners to happily learn and be well rounded on intelligence, emotion, and consciousness. This would lead the graduates to become perfect humans in physical, mental, and intellectual aspects along the principle of morality-led knowledge and could happily coexist with others (Office of the Education Council, 2008, and, Office of the Education Council, 2009). For all these reasons, the researcher had utilized the contemplative education as the main conceptual framework to develop the main substances of curriculum of the course being developed as well as using the contemplative education techniques in organizing the learning processes or activities to assure the desirable characteristics of the graduates satisfying the needs of the society at the present time. Contemplative education was based on the belief that the true education had to be the action of developing humans to access the truth, goodness, and beauty. It was also used as the process for mental and intellectual development in a holistic way to assure the balance and perfection to make the learners good and happy to be concerned with society and make it happy and equal (Asdornnithee, Somsit, 2009). The specific objective 8 of the course curriculum clearly prescribed that at the end of the instruction, the learners could develop their mind and intelligence to learn and understand life and happily maintain everyday life. Objective 9 was also compatible in expecting the learners to understand themselves, know and understand others, and to create happiness from giving. All these are happiness development along contemplative education.

5.2.2 Effects of Using the Curriculum

In using curriculum of the course Science and Art of Happiness Creation along contemplative education for undergraduate students of Chiang Mai University The researcher had discussed the effects of using the curriculum on the issues found in using the curriculum via the learning activities with contemplative

education techniques. The results of using the curriculum along the prescribed variables, namely, happiness and satisfaction of the learners are as follows:

- 1) Concerning the implementation of the curriculum in organizing the learning activities, it was found that during weeks 1 to 3, most learners had not yet well actualized the contemplative education techniques. This could have been because such techniques such as the deep listening was an attentive listening by which the learners had to listen with mind not just ears. This technique required some practice. Typically, we often lack of attentive listening. Many would listen and promptly react or jump to judge. We could not listen to anything long and could not prolong our listening if unable to react. The researcher had emphasized to the learners that they had to practice it including the dialogue which also include the deep listening and reflection. Reflection on one's learning was regarded an important technique for organizing the learning activities. It could help to generalize and analyze if the learners had been critical and deeply listening which were hard to imply from simply observe from outside gestures. It could be reflected from the learner's speaking or writing up on what he/she had learned. However, after the fifth week, the learners had increasingly developed their contemplative education techniques until the 14th week where the learners had engaged in the practicum outside under the mind practice to create happiness program when almost all of the learners had positive attitude towards the practice. They had reflected well feeling in that week. One of them reflected that *"I have felt clam and relaxed and had not even a moment to thinking about any distracting things though there were a whole pile of work waiting for me to finish. I was totally attached to my conscious. This time, I am concentrated and feel relaxed. After engaging the water pouring and kindness giving away ceremony, I have felt fulfilled. Though having spent not much time, I have got a lot of good things in return – better life quality, knowing my own thinking process better, knowing how to attach mind with body better, or having conscious on the things being done better, etc."* It could evaluated that most learners had learned and gained

knowledge from core course contents, also they well utilized the 5 essential contemplative techniques.

Besides the subjects' learning achievement, most of them have got grade B+ and A that confirmed the outcomes of learning above. Furthermore, we found that five small groups of subjects could write and presented the happiness developing projects based on their knowledge and experience learned from this course been at much to rather the most level. The reasons for this achievements might be the measurement and evaluation of this course that we focused on authentic evaluation, practicing, and let the students have participation in evaluation process, both self-evaluation and peer – evaluation, that's why they had gained knowledge and experience more.

- 2) Regarding the score on student's happiness in general, the mean scores were not statistically different before and after using the curriculum. The mean score before using the curriculum was 114.80 and 115.18 afterward which were slightly different. There were, however, 4 items whose pre-score was statistically different from the post-score. All these could support the claim that the curriculum had helped the learners to develop their own happiness though lacking the quantitative confirm. However, when each item was analyzed, particularly the 14th one, which was an important perception that indicated one's awareness of his/her happiness or suffering. Human's happiness lays on realizing value and usefulness of things for themselves including the realization that one had more happiness than others who were at the same socio-economic status. One's perception of his/her value or usefulness is known as self-esteem which is a positive construct enabling the individual to have hope and motivation in maintaining life. When examining the feeling and opinion of the learners reflected on the instruction at the final exam time, it was found that the learners had evaluated the course as useful making them know themselves in a positive way, know how to make their mind calm and conscious, learn moral principles and reminders, have new perspective, share and exchange ideas, obtain method to create

happiness, be increasingly able to create happiness for themselves, etc. They wished that the students should take the course at early years as it could serve as the base for successful study and understanding life and education. The most important thing was their happily studying and ability to apply the knowledge into their everyday life maintenance and happily coexist in the society with others. Other positive attitudes included their viewing the course in proving knowledge and experiences that could be applicable to their study and life, the course contents were not stressful nor too long. It could help the learners to adjust their attitude toward the study and profession as well as their perspectives on the world and life to change their life on better direction. Most important was that they had happiness with and after the study. The learners proposed that the course should be offered in every semester.

- 3) Regarding the learner's satisfaction, it was found that the score on their satisfaction in general was at high level. All of the 6 aspects of satisfaction had the score at high level and up with the one on opportunity for progress and relationship with the classmates were both at the highest levels. When considering the percentage of the students, it was found that almost two thirds of the learners, or 64.71%, were satisfied with their relationship with the classmates. Slightly more than half of them, 50.99% were satisfied with the opportunity for progress as well. When all aspects were combined, most of the learners or more than 72.55% were satisfied with the study at high to the highest levels. For the opportunity for progress, there were no satisfaction at the medium level at all. All these evidences showed that the course had high satisfied the learners. This might be because the content and process of the course are something close to their existence. It was about their everyday life which had not been concerned by other courses, particularly those in their specific or professional category. This is the case though happiness or suffering are to be encountered by all. This contention was supported by the evaluation of the learners reflecting that this course had provided knowledge unavailable from other courses in general and could truly be

applicable in their everyday life making them aware of and understand the reality of life, get deeper touch on the Dhamma which had taught them both of the worldly and moral ones including the practice on consciousness and meditation outside university. The result of this research also agreed with that of Anekawit, Narumon (2009) who had implemented curriculum basing on contemplative education with 3rd year nursing students of Sri Mahasarakham Nursing College and found that the students were satisfied with the curriculum at the highest level. Anekawit analyzed and discussed the finding that the content of the course and the instruction basing on contemplative education techniques which included deep listening, contemplating or *Yonisomanasikara*, and dialogue helped the learners to exchange and share knowledge leading them along the right direction directly stimulate their intelligence and morality citing Phra Phrom Kunaporn who explained the use of *Yonisomanasikara*.

Concerning the satisfaction with the relationship among the classmates in the classroom, the satisfaction was found to be at the highest level reflecting that the instruction process basing on contemplative education particularly the dialogue and deep listening which helped the learners to have attitude and friendliness toward one another. This was also enhanced by the outside practice together where they learned and worked in groups. Some learners had reflected this attitude through their reflection writing such as this one who said *“The group dialogue has made me learn to listen to others and reflected on things around us... We have used emotion less and listened to the suffering of others and learned to create happiness to ourselves and others more.”* or *“This course is not at all stressing... We have got both the knowledge, happiness, and friendship from friends and senior students who take the course.”* and *“I wish the younger friends have chance to learn this course because most of them are stressed from the study in general. Studying in this course, we are not depressed but happy in having friends.”*

All these research findings reveal that the curriculum of the course on science and art of happiness creation basing on contemplative education for undergraduate students at Chiang Mai University was the curriculum that benefited the learners. The sample subjects were satisfied with the learning and had realized the benefits and values of the content of the course and had thought that they would apply the knowledge and experience to their study and everyday life maintenance in an appropriate way to gain happiness. The course should an elective course to be taken by Chiang Mai University undergraduate students to acquire knowledge and happiness as found by this research.

5.3 Recommendations

5.3.1 Recommendations for Using the Course Curriculum

- 1) Faculties or institutes affiliated with Chiang Mai University could apply the findings of this research in modifying their undergraduate program by including this course as one of the general education courses in humanities and social sciences either as a required or elective one. And other faculties or universities could apply the findings of this research in their process of curriculum development on general education courses too. Moreover the faculty members of the faculties or institutes could advise their undergraduate students to enroll in this course as a general education one from the early years of their study to be assured that the learners would have more knowledge and understanding about human life and education, contemplative education, and happiness development which could serve as the foundation of their study and everyday life maintenance with happiness.
- 2) As this course had been carried out by utilizing E-Learning, the lecturers have to be well-informed and have skill in the learning management system (LMS) and the efficient online social media such as Facebook. They also needs equipment such Note Book, Tablet, or Smart Phone to facilitate the instructional management particularly on part of the communication which is quick and accurate.

- 3) The university should use the course curriculum in an efficient way. It has to make the internet system available and effective LMS to assure the effectiveness of the instructional provision via E-Learning.
- 4) As the content of the course is apparently abstract and conceptual which requires true understanding and insight as it is about human life, contemplative education, and happiness, the lecturers who would apply this course curriculum have to make themselves deeply understand about the content both in theory and putting into practice.
- 5) The training resources for the learners should be appropriately identified and set particularly those for meditation which required calm and safety or Sappaya including the resource persons who are knowledgeable and have experiences on the issues to serve as assistant facilitators for the learners.
- 6) There should not be more learners for each section, because a lecturer as the facilitator has to organize variety of learning activities, e.g. group activities and dialogue online in which she/he has to be closely involved with the learners and take time to follow up their learning progress, homework, and checking the online assignments. This is particularly the case when the outside practice is concerned.
- 7) The learners should be trained to use the information media, equipment, and tools from the first day of the course. It should not be assumed that the new generation youths would always be keen on these.
- 8) The atmosphere facilitating the the learner's learning should be built up from the first day onwards such as the introduction between the learners and the lecturer to make them familiar with one another. Students do not necessarily always sit on the desk and chair. Sometimes they could sit on the floor to feel relaxed and relevant to the learning activities being engaged, particularly those on dialogue.

5.4 Recommendation for Further Researches

5.4.1 There should be the study on short course training about happiness or others variables for undergraduate students, and developed the course basing on contemplative education. The course could be designed as a module, for example eight days for training course, we can conduct the course on every weekend and so on.

5.4.2 This course curriculum should be offered to undergraduate students of other universities. And it should be modified to fit for the learners there, and study the effects of course implementation in terms of other variables, not only happiness and satisfaction.

5.4.3 There should a study on curriculum development of other general education courses whose content and objectives are similar to this course.