

RESEARCH SYNTHESIS AND META-ANALYSIS

A Step-by-Step Approach

HARRIS COOPER

FIFTH EDITION

APPLIED SOCIAL RESEARCH METHODS SERIES

Volume 2

BRIEF CONTENTS

Preface to the Fifth Edition	xiv
Acknowledgments	xvii
About the Author	xviii
1. Introduction: Literature Reviews, Research Syntheses, and Meta-Analyses	1
2. Step 1: Formulating the Problem	30
3. Step 2: Searching the Literature	61
4. Step 3: Gathering Information From Studies	110
5. Step 4: Evaluating the Quality of Studies	151
6. Step 5: Analyzing and Integrating the Outcomes of Studies	189
7. Step 6: Interpreting the Evidence	261
8. Step 7: Presenting the Results	286
9. Conclusion: Threats to the Validity of Research Synthesis Conclusions	318
References	335
Author Index	347
Subject Index	351

DETAILED CONTENTS

Preface to the Fifth Edition	xiv
Acknowledgments	xvii
About the Author	xviii
 1. Introduction: Literature Reviews, Research Syntheses, and Meta-Analyses	 1
The Need for Attention to Research Synthesis	2
Goals and Premises of the Book	4
Definitions of Literature Reviews	5
Why We Need Research Syntheses Based on Scientific Principles	9
<i>Principal Outcomes of a Research Synthesis</i>	11
A Brief History of Research Synthesis and Meta-Analysis	12
The Stages of Research Synthesis	15
<i>Step 1: Formulating the Problem</i>	20
<i>Step 2: Searching the Literature</i>	21
<i>Step 3: Gathering Information From Studies</i>	21
<i>Step 4: Evaluating the Quality of Studies</i>	22
<i>Step 5: Analyzing and Integrating the Outcomes of Studies</i>	22
<i>Step 6: Interpreting the Evidence</i>	23
<i>Step 7: Presenting the Results</i>	23
Twenty Questions About Research Syntheses	23
Four Examples of Research Synthesis	26
<i>The Effects of Choice on Intrinsic Motivation (Patall, Cooper, & Robinson, 2008)</i>	26
<i>The Effect of Homework on Academic Achievement (Cooper, Robinson, & Patall, 2006)</i>	27

<i>Individual Differences in Attitudes Toward Rape</i> <i>(Anderson, Cooper, & Okamura, 1997)</i>	28
<i>Aerobic Exercise and Neurocognitive</i> <i>Performance (Smith et al., 2010)</i>	28
2. Step 1: Formulating the Problem	30
Definition of Variables in Social Science Research	33
<i>Similarities in Concepts and Operations in</i> <i>Primary Research and Research Synthesis</i>	33
<i>Differences in Concepts and Operations in</i> <i>Primary Research and Research Synthesis</i>	34
Multiple Operations in Research Synthesis	36
<i>Multiple Operationism and Concept-to-Operation</i> <i>Correspondence</i>	37
Defining the Relationship of Interest	41
<i>Quantitative or Qualitative Research?</i>	42
<i>Description, Association, or Causal Relationship?</i>	43
<i>Within-Participant or Between-Participant Processes?</i>	46
<i>Simple and Complex Relationships</i>	47
<i>Summary</i>	48
Judging the Conceptual Relevance of Studies	50
Study-Generated and Synthesis-Generated Evidence	54
<i>Summary</i>	56
Arguing for the Value of the Synthesis	56
<i>If a Synthesis Already Exists, Why Is a</i> <i>New One Needed?</i>	58
<i>The Effects of Context on Synthesis Outcomes</i>	59
Notes	60
3. Step 2: Searching the Literature	61
Population Distinctions in Social Science Research	63
Methods for Locating Studies	64
<i>The Fate of Studies From Initiation</i> <i>to Publication</i>	65
<i>Some Ways Searching Channels Differ</i>	67
Researcher-to-Researcher Channels	68
<i>Personal Contact</i>	70
<i>Mass Solicitations</i>	71

<i>Traditional Invisible Colleges</i>	73
<i>Electronic Invisible Colleges</i>	75
Quality-Controlled Channels	77
<i>Conference Presentations</i>	78
<i>Scholarly Journals</i>	80
<i>Peer Review and Publication Bias</i>	83
Secondary Channels	85
<i>Research Report Reference Lists</i>	87
<i>Research Bibliographies</i>	89
<i>Prospective Research Registers</i>	90
<i>The Internet</i>	90
<i>Reference Databases</i>	93
Conducting Searches of Reference Databases	96
Determining the Adequacy of Literature Searches	100
Problems in Document Retrieval	102
The Effects of Literature Searching on	
Synthesis Outcomes	103
Notes	109
4. Step 3: Gathering Information From Studies	110
Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	111
Developing a Coding Guide	112
Information to Include on a Coding Guide	114
<i>Low- and High-Inference Codes</i>	131
Selecting and Training Coders	133
<i>Transferring Information to the Data File</i>	137
Problems in Gathering Data From Study Reports	137
<i>Imprecise Research Reports</i>	138
Identifying Independent Comparisons	142
<i>Research Teams as Units</i>	144
<i>Studies as Units</i>	144
<i>Samples as Units</i>	145
<i>Comparisons or Estimates as Units</i>	146
<i>Shifting Unit of Analysis</i>	147
<i>Statistical Adjustment</i>	148
The Effects of Data Gathering on Synthesis	
Outcomes	149

5. Step 4: Evaluating the Quality of Studies	151
Problems in Judging Research Quality	154
<i>Predispositions of the Judge</i>	154
<i>Judges' Disagreement About What Constitutes</i>	
<i>Research Quality</i>	157
<i>Differences Among Quality Scales</i>	159
<i>A Priori Exclusion of Research Versus A Posteriori</i>	
<i>Examination of Research Differences</i>	161
Approaches to Categorizing Research Methods	163
<i>Threats-to-Validity Approach</i>	164
<i>Methods-Description Approach</i>	166
<i>A Mixed-Criteria Approach: The Study DIAD</i>	168
Identifying Statistical Outliers	187
6. Step 5: Analyzing and Integrating the	
Outcomes of Studies	189
Data Analysis in Primary Research and Research	
Synthesis	191
Meta-Analysis	192
<i>Meta-Analysis Comes of Age</i>	194
<i>When Not to Do a Meta-Analysis</i>	194
<i>The Impact of Integrating Techniques on</i>	
<i>Synthesis Outcomes</i>	198
Main Effects and Interactions in Meta-Analysis	199
Meta-Analysis and the Variation Among	
Study Results	200
<i>Sources of Variability in Research Findings</i>	200
Vote Counting	204
<i>Combining Significance Levels</i>	208
Measuring Relationship Strength	209
<i>Definition of Effect Size</i>	210
<i>Standardized Mean Difference: The d-index or</i>	
<i>g-index</i>	212
<i>Effect Sizes Based on Two Continuous Variables:</i>	
<i>The r-Index</i>	216
<i>Effect Sizes Based on Two Dichotomous Variables:</i>	
<i>The Odds and Risk Ratios</i>	219

<i>Practical Issues in Estimating Effect Sizes</i>	220
<i>Coding Effect Sizes</i>	227
Combining Effect Sizes Across Studies	229
<i>The d-Index</i>	230
<i>The r-Index</i>	233
<i>A Note on Combining Slopes From</i>	
<i>Multiple Regressions</i>	235
<i>The Synthesis Examples</i>	236
Analyzing Variance in Effect Sizes Across Findings	237
<i>Traditional Inferential Statistics</i>	238
<i>Comparing Observed to Expected Variance:</i>	
<i>Fixed-Effect Models</i>	239
<i>Homogeneity Analyses</i>	240
<i>Comparing Observed and Expected Variance:</i>	
<i>Random-Effects Models</i>	245
<i>I²: The Study-Level Measure of Effect</i>	248
<i>Statistical Power in Meta-Analysis</i>	249
<i>Meta-Regression: Considering Multiple Moderators</i>	
<i>Simultaneously or Sequentially</i>	251
<i>Using Computer Statistical Packages</i>	253
Some Advanced Techniques in Meta-Analysis	254
<i>Hierarchical Linear Modeling</i>	254
<i>Model-Based Meta-Analysis</i>	254
<i>Bayesian Meta-Analysis</i>	255
<i>Meta-Analysis Using Individual Participant Data</i>	256
Cumulating Results Across Meta-Analyses	257
Notes	259
7. Step 6: Interpreting the Evidence	261
Missing Data	263
Statistical Sensitivity Analyses	265
Specification and Generalization	267
<i>Integrating Interaction Results Across Studies</i>	268
Study-Generated and Synthesis-Generated Evidence	270
The Substantive Interpretation of Effect Size	271
<i>The Size of the Relationship</i>	271
<i>Using Adjectives to Convey the Practical</i>	
<i>Significance of Effects</i>	274

<i>Using Adjectives to Convey Proven and Promising Findings</i>	276
<i>Should Researchers Supply Labels at All?</i>	277
Metrics That Are Meaningful to General Audiences	278
<i>Raw and Familiar Transformed Scores</i>	279
<i>Translations of the Standardized Mean Difference</i>	279
<i>Translations of Binomial Effect Size Display</i>	284
<i>Translations of Effects Involving Two Continuous Measures</i>	284
Conclusion	285
Note	285
8. Step 7: Presenting the Results	286
Report Writing in Social Science Research	287
Meta-Analysis Reporting Standards (MARS)	288
<i>Title</i>	288
<i>Abstract</i>	293
<i>The Introduction Section</i>	293
<i>The Method Section</i>	294
<i>The Results Section</i>	301
<i>The Discussion Section</i>	316
Notes	317
9. Conclusion: Threats to the Validity of Research	
Synthesis Conclusions	318
Validity Issues	319
Criticism of Research Synthesis and Meta-Analysis	327
Feasibility and Cost	328
The Scientific Method and Disconfirmation	333
Creativity in Research Synthesis	333
Conclusion	334
References	335
Author Index	347
Subject Index	351