

# A People's Court?

A BOTTOM-UP APPROACH  
TO LITIGATION BEFORE THE  
EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE

**Jos Hoevenaars**

**eløven**  
international publishing

p64  
8,492.-

สำนักหอสมุดมหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่

b 16476935  
OL 42383  
j 2285735

# A PEOPLE'S COURT?

A Bottom-Up Approach to Litigation Before  
the European Court of Justice

Jos Hoevenaars



eleven  
international publishing

# Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	XI
1 INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Individual Litigants Before the European Court of Justice	1
1.2 Changing Power Relations in Europe	2
1.3 Euro-Litigation: A View from the Inside	4
1.4 Methodology	6
1.5 Aims and Limitations	13
1.6 Structure of the Book	14
PART I	
2 PROMISES AND EXPECTATIONS	
2.1 Introduction	19
2.2 The Promise of the European Court of Justice	19
2.3 The Promise of EU Law	21
2.4 Giving the Citizen a Role in European Law Enforcement	23
2.5 EU Law and the New 'Public Power'	25
2.6 Access to the European Court of Justice	26
2.7 An Infringement Procedure for the European Citizen?	29
2.8 Conclusion	32
3 THE POLITICAL ROLE OF THE ECJ	
3.1 Introduction	35
3.2 Early Scholarly Interest in the Court of Justice	35
3.3 Competing Political Science Perspectives on European Integration	37
3.4 The Magic Triangle of the Legal System	39
3.5 Integrationist Dynamic: The Inter-Court Dialogue	40
3.6 Connecting the Citizen to EU Law	42
3.7 Participation Through Law Enforcement	43
3.8 Token Cases and Selecting on the Dependent Variable	45
3.9 Playing the Eurolaw Game: Indications of an Uneven Playing Field	47
3.10 The View from a Distance	50
3.11 Materialising the Individual Litigant	51
3.12 Conclusion	53

PART II

4 A LOOK BELOW THE SURFACE

4.1	Introduction	59
4.2	Preliminary References in Numbers	60
4.3	Intermediate Conclusion	67
4.4	On Proactive and Reactive Litigation	68
4.5	Litigant Characteristics	71
4.6	The 'Irrational' Litigant: Dealing with Assumptions of Interest	72
4.7	Reaching for that 'Final' Judgment	73
4.8	'Frivolous' Litigation	75
4.9	Individual Persistence: Surviving the Legal System	77
4.10	Stakes and Impact: Perspectives on Success	79
4.11	Promises and Expectations: (Mis)understanding the Court	83
4.12	Conclusion	87

CASE STUDY A. CATERING EMPLOYEES

A.1	Introduction: Gaul v. the Romans	89
A.2	The Dispute	89
A.3	Organizing Legal Opposition	91
A.4	The Legal Battle	93
A.5	Effects of the Ruling	98
A.6	Deductions from a 'Victory for the Little Guy'	99
A.7	ECJ to the Rescue	100
A.8	Collective versus Collective	101

5 A COLLECTION OF INTERESTS

5.1	Introduction	103
5.2	Real and Nominal Litigants	103
5.3	Employing an Individual Case	107
5.4	The Transformation: How Individual Interests Become Collective	110
5.5	The Art of Soliciting a Reference	111
5.6	Cause Lawyering and the Balancing of Interests	114
5.7	Conclusion	119

CASE STUDY B. PENSIONERS ABROAD

B.1	Introduction: Between Social Rights and Free Movement	121
B.2	The Contested Policy	122
B.3	Consequences for Pensioners Living Abroad	124
B.4	Organizing Opposition	125
B.5	Extra-Legal Opposition	127

B.6	Legal Contestation: From Pillar to Post	129
B.7	Effects of the Legal Contest	136
B.8	Collective Mobilisation	137
B.9	Assigning Blame and Finding The Right Forum	138
6	LAWYERING EUROLAW	
6.1	Introduction	141
6.2	Lawyers and References: Allocating Effects in Eurolaw Expertise	142
6.3	Allocating Resources	144
6.4	Going to Luxembourg	146
6.5	Legal Aid and References	147
6.6	Lawyers' Motivation	150
6.7	Eurolaw Expertise	152
6.8	Coping Strategies	160
6.9	Macro Effects of the Allocation of Eurolaw Expertise	162
6.10	Conclusion	163

CASE STUDY C. FEES IN MIGRATION LAW
-------------------------------------

C.1	Introduction: Championing the Rights of Migrants	167
C.2	The Contested Policy	167
C.3	Organizing Opposition: Introducing the IOT	170
C.4	Extra-Legal Opposition to the Policy	171
C.5	The Decision to Take Legal Action	173
C.6	Legal Contestations	174
C.7	Effects of the Various Cases for Dutch Policy	178
C.8	Deductions From a Long Contest: Credentials of the Working Group	181
C.9	The ECJ as an Unintended Target	182
C.10	Government Stance as Push Factor	183
C.11	Advantages of Organised Opposition	185

### PART III

7	CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES	
7.1	Introduction	189
7.2	Opportunities in EU Law	190
7.3	The EU Legal System Reviewed	192
7.4	Awareness, Opportunity and the Litigability of EU Rules	195
7.5	Standing Rules and Strategically Choosing Cases	199
7.6	The National Court: Before and After Referral	202

7.7	Lessons from the Netherlands: Recipes for Getting Access	203
7.8	Networks and Alliances: A Learning Curve?	211
7.9	Conclusion	213

#### CASE STUDY D. INTEGRATION ABROAD

D.1	Introduction: Investigating an Invisible Case	215
D.2	The Contested Policy	215
D.3	Organizing Opposition	216
D.4	Legal Contestation	217
D.5	Government Intervention	221
D.6	The Aftermath	223
D.7	The Traveling Commission Opinion	225
D.8	Deductions from an Invisible Case	226
D.9	Changing Context, Same Questions?	227
D.10	The Withdrawal of References	229

#### 8 PRELIMINARY REFERENCE AS A MULTIPLIER OF INTERESTS

8.1	Introduction	231
8.2	The European Commission: Repeat Player Par Excellence	232
8.3	The Commission as Guardian of the Treaties	233
8.4	Preliminary References as Alternative Enforcement	236
8.5	Two Pathways to Allying with the Ultimate Repeat Player	238
8.6	Mobilising the Commission	240
8.7	Unsolicited Alliances: The Commission Behind the Scenes	243
8.8	The Weight of Commission Involvement	245
8.9	The Commission as an Additional Opponent	246
8.10	The European Commission: Concluding Remarks	247
8.11	Member States as Repeat Players Before the ECJ	249
8.12	The Netherlands Before the ECJ	250
8.13	Preliminary References: Raising the Stakes	251
8.14	Member State Advantages Before the Court	253
8.15	Private Parties Versus Member States	254
8.16	Member States' Control of the ECJ Docket	259
8.17	The Member States: Concluding Remarks	261
8.18	Conclusion	262

## PART IV

9	CONCLUSIONS	
9.1	Euro-litigation Empowering EU Citizens?	267
9.2	Understanding Individual Litigation before the ECJ	268
9.3	Participation-Through-Law and the Assumption of Interest	269
9.4	The Multifarious Functions of the Preliminary Reference Procedure	273
9.5	The Enforcement Role of Litigation	275
9.6	Cause Lawyering and Pressure Through EU Law	276
9.7	Reviewing the Dual Logic of Private Enforcement	279
9.8	Re-Positioning the Individual in the European Legal System	282
9.9	Methodological Reflections	284
9.10	Remaining Questions and Future Research Agenda	285
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	291
	APPENDICES	307
	CURRICULUM VITAE	319