

OXFORD



COMPARATIVE LAW

UWE KISCHEL

สำนักหอสมุดมหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่

Comparative Law

by

UWE KISCHEL

Dr. jur., LL.M. (Yale), attorney-at-law (New York),
Mercator Professor of Public Law,
European Law, and Comparative Law
at the University of Greifswald, Germany



Translated by

ANDREW HAMMEL

B.A. (University of Texas at Austin), J.D.
(University of Houston Law Center),
LL.M. (Harvard), former assistant professor
(Heinrich-Heine-University Düsseldorf)

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

p64
7,087.60

16477054
01202406
1 2287558

Contents

PART I: GENERAL ASPECTS OF COMPARATIVE LAW

Chapter 1. Introduction: What Is Comparative Law?	3
A. Doing Comparative Law: An Overview	3
I. Comparative Law and Foreign Law Studies	4
1. Determining the Relevant Law	4
2. Comparison and Evaluation	5
3. National Reports and General Reports	6
4. "Foreign Law Studies" Does Not Exist	7
II. Functional Comparative Law	7
III. Individual Comparison and Type Comparison	9
B. Comparative Law and Other Disciplines	10
I. Legal Translation	10
II. Legal History	12
III. Sociology of Law	15
IV. Legal Ethnology, Legal Ethology, Legal Anthropology	17
1. Legal Ethnology	17
2. Legal Ethology	19
3. Legal Anthropology	19
V. Private International Law (Conflict of Laws)	20
VI. Comparative Politics	23
C. Comparative Law as an Independent Discipline: A Never-Ending Story	27
I. A Play on Words	27
II. Method or Independent Legal Discipline?	28
1. An Insignificant Question	28
2. Investigating the Historical Relations Between Legal Systems	29
3. Microcomparison as Method, Macrocomparison as Science?	30
D. Modesty in Comparative Law	31
E. Comparative Law in Many Fields of Law	34
I. Universality of Comparative Law	34
II. Ideology and Comparative Law	36
1. From Impartiality to Value Judgments	36
a) Political Values in Public Law and Beyond	36
b) Political Character and <i>Praesumptio Similitudinis</i>	37
c) Human Rights as a Yardstick	38
2. Universality and Relativity of Human Rights	39
a) Human Rights as Western and Individualistic Values	40
b) Human Rights as Claims	41
c) The Struggle for Human Rights—Independent of Culture and Religion	42
d) Universality and Specific Circumstances	43
Chapter 2. Aims of Comparative Law	45
A. No Need for Justification	45
B. General Aims and Direct Uses of Comparative Law	46
I. Communication	47
1. Differences in (Legal) Culture	47
2. Cultural Imperialism in Law	48
3. Legal Practice	50

II. Significance for Legal Education	51
III. Improved Understanding of National Law	53
IV. Legislation and Comparative Law	54
1. Foreign Legal Influence in General	54
a) Typical Examples of Foreign Legal Influence	54
b) Influence Beyond National Law	55
c) Successes, Failures, and Open Questions	56
d) Foreign Legal Influence: Reasons and Empirical Importance	57
2. Legal Transplants	59
a) Typical Questions About Legal Transplants	60
b) Are Legal Transplants at All Possible?	62
c) Categories of Legal Transplants	63
3. Unification and Harmonization of Laws	64
a) Harmonization of Laws: Universal, European, Regional	64
b) Uniform Laws, Model Laws	65
c) Setting an Example in Europe: The Principles of European Contract Law	66
V. Interpretation and Comparative Law	69
1. Interpretation of Law with Foreign Elements: Comparative Interpretation in a Wider Sense	69
2. Interpretation of Genuinely National Law: Comparative Interpretation in a Narrower Sense	72
a) The Traditional Call for Comparative Interpretation	72
b) The Paradigm of Textual Evolution and the "Fifth Method of Interpretation"	73
c) Toward a Cultural and Comparative Interpretation	73
d) Again: The Problem of National Autonomy	75
e) Facilitating Interpretation in Difficult Cases: Classic Examples	78
3. Practical Problems and Solutions	81
VI. Comparative Law as a Source of Law: Public International Law and EU Law	83
 Chapter 3. The Comparative Method	 87
A. The Methodological Problem of Comparative Law: An Overview	87
B. The Starting Point: Functional Comparison	88
C. Criticizing Functional Comparison	90
I. Criticizing the Process	90
1. The Function in Law	90
2. The Process of Comparison	91
3. The Cultural Context	92
4. Neutrality	92
II. Criticizing the Background	94
1. Fixation on Unity	94
2. Positivism, Not Realism	94
3. Goal Definition	95
4. Isolation	96
III. Postmodern Critique	97
1. The Problem of Description and Self-Description of Postmodern Texts	97
2. Basic Concepts of Postmodern Thinking	98
3. Postmodern Criticism of Comparative Law	99
D. Alternatives to Functional Comparison	102
I. Variations of the Classical Approach	102
1. Determine, Understand, Compare: A 3-Phase Model	102
2. Practical Instructions in Eight Steps	104
3. The Theory of Legal Formants	106
a) Formants and the Multiple Layers of Legal Thinking	106
b) Of Preaching to the Choir, and its Dangers	108

4. Dialectical Comparison	110
a) Comparison as an Evaluative Circular Process	110
b) Dialectics as Reality	111
II. Partial Modifications	112
1. Comparative Law and Economic Analysis	112
a) Economic Analysis of Law	112
aa) Liability as an Example	113
bb) Basic Ideas and Basic Terminology of Economic Analysis	114
b) Economic Analysis in Comparative Law	117
c) Criticizing Economic Analysis	119
aa) Central Problems of Economization	119
(1) Of Fish and Smoke: Two Examples	119
(2) <i>Homo Economicus</i> and Thinking in Models	120
(3) Efficiency Criteria	122
(4) Monetization and Justice	123
(5) Treatment of Alternative Criteria	126
(6) Psychology, Didactics, and a Self-Fulfilling Prophecy	128
bb) Problems of an Economic Approach in Comparative Law	129
2. Conceptual Comparison	130
a) Modeling and Comparing: A Program in Two Phases	130
b) Importance and Influence of the Model	132
3. Statistical Comparison	134
a) Numerical Representation and Correlation of Law	134
b) The Devil in the Detail	136
aa) Reduction of Complex Facts to Simple Numbers	136
bb) Insinuating Scientific Precision	139
cc) Causalities	140
dd) Influences of Economic and Legal Policies	141
III. Different Aims	143
1. Legal Transplants	143
2. Comparative Jurisprudence	144
3. Legal Traditions	146
a) The Openness of Traditions	146
b) The Terminology of Legal Traditions	148
4. Big Issues	149
IV. And Postmodernism?	151
E. Toward a Contextual Comparison	152
I. Searching for Methods and Theories	152
1. In Search of the Recipe	152
2. Analytical Approach vs. Hermeneutics	153
a) Analytical and Historical Questions	154
b) Historical Questions and Hermeneutical Methods	156
c) Hermeneutics and Comparative Law	158
3. Comparative Law and Legal Methods	160
II. The Variety of Comparative Questions: A Typology	162
1. Classic Comparison: Comparing Problems and Comparing Concepts	162
2. Comparing the Operating Conditions of Law	164
3. Typical Sub-Questions	164
4. Voluntary Reference to Foreign Legal Ideas	165
5. Mandatory Comparisons	165
6. Abstract and Systematic Questions	166
III. Objectives and Limits of the Functional Method	166
1. The Essence of Functional Thinking and its Caricature	166
a) Functionalism: Self-Image and Perception by Others	166
b) Ignoring the Diversity of Cultures and Functions?	167

c) Fixation on Unity?	168
d) Neutral Perspective?	168
2. Limits of Functional Thinking	170
a) Limited Questions	170
b) Exaggerated Conclusions	171
3. Different Styles of Thinking	173
IV. Context Comparison as the Common Element	173
V. Unity in Diversity: A System of Mistakes in Comparative Law	174
1. Mistakes in Capturing Terms	175
a) Problems of Reading and Translation	175
b) Problems of Sources	176
c) Understanding a Term's Content	177
d) Prior Understanding of Terms: The Significance	179
2. Ignoring Functional Equivalents	180
3. A Narrow Field of Vision	180
a) The Doctrinal Setting	180
aa) Relativizing Differences	180
bb) Typical Misinterpretations	181
b) The Cultural Setting	182
aa) Role of Law and Legal Institutions	182
bb) Legal Thinking and Legal Tools	183
c) Extra-Legal Aspects	185
4. Seeing Through National Lenses: Rule vs. Exception	185
5. Law in Books, Law in Action, and Law in Debate	186
VI. Writing a Comparative Law Study: Some Practical Remarks	188
1. Possible Structures of a Classical Comparative Study	189
a) Simple Juxtaposition and Comparison	189
b) Dovetailed Comparison	192
c) Description from a Native Legal Perspective	193
2. A Classic Way to Proceed	194
a) Finding a Topic	194
b) Reading and Familiarizing	195
c) Studying Foreign Sources	196
d) Differences, Similarities, and Preliminary Structures	198
e) Broadening the View	199
f) Final Structure and Writing a First Draft	200

Chapter 4. Legal Families, Legal Culture, and Context	201
A. The Idea of Legal Families	201
B. Some Approaches to Legal Families	201
I. Conventional Classifications	201
II. Unusual Classifications	203
III. Hierarchical Classifications	204
IV. On Terminology: Legal Families, Legal Systems, Legal Groups	204
C. Sense and Nonsense of Classifications	205
I. Classification as a Scientific Task?	205
II. Choosing Foreign Legal Systems and Saving Effort?	206
III. Understanding the Context	208
IV. Didactics	208
V. Further Points of Criticism	208
VI. Practical Importance of Legal Families	210
D. The Debate on Legal Culture	211
I. The Comparative Starting Point	211
II. The Debate in Legal Sociology	212
1. Multitude of Definitions	212

2. The Dispute about the Purpose	214
a) Theory vs. Pragmatism	214
b) Further Problems of Legal Culture	216
III. Consequences for Comparative Law	216
1. Different Interests and Different Approaches in Legal Sociology	216
2. The Specifically Legal Approach	218
E. A Pragmatic Contextual Perspective	220
I. Context, Not Culture	220
II. Exemplary, Not Ideal-Typical Approach	221
III. Elements of Context	222
1. Relative Importance of Historical Aspects	222
2. Non-Legal Elements and Their Determination	222
3. Multitude of Factors	223

PART II: THE CONTEXTS OF LEGAL SYSTEMS

Chapter 5. The Context of Common Law	227
A. Common Law as Case Law	227
I. The Notion of "Common Law"	227
II. The Classic Core of Common Law	228
1. Development by Cases	228
a) Inductive Thinking: Of Colorful Walls	229
b) Legal Development in Common Law: The Snail in the Bottle	232
2. Precedent and Distinguishing	238
a) Ratio Decidendi and Obiter Dictum	239
b) Hierarchy of Courts	240
c) Distinguishing	241
d) Persuasive Precedent	242
3. The Role of Statutes	242
4. The Role of Academic Literature	243
III. The Common Law Mindset	246
1. Common Law as Judge-Made Law	246
2. Cases as Arguments	247
3. Procedural Orientation	247
4. System, Abstract Reasoning, and Law	249
5. Law and Fact	251
B. Historical Development	253
I. Formation of the Common Law After 1066	253
II. The Royal Courts in Westminster	254
III. Writs	256
1. Characteristics and Creation of Writs	256
2. Procedural vs. Substantive Thinking	257
3. End and Continuing Effect of Writs	259
IV. Equity	261
1. Basic Idea: Equity as a Question of Conscience	261
2. Typical Rules of Equity	262
3. Practical Problems of Equity	263
4. Equity Today	265
C. Courts and Jurists	266
I. Court Structure	266
1. England: Complexity and Modernization	266
a) Tribunals	267
b) Magistrates' Courts, County Courts	268
c) Crown Court	268

d) High Court	269
e) Court of Appeal	269
f) House of Lords and Supreme Court	270
2. USA: Federal Structure	272
a) State Courts and Federal Courts	272
b) Hierarchy of Federal Courts	273
aa) Federal District Court and Court of Appeals	273
bb) The Appeal Between Fact and Law	273
cc) U.S. Supreme Court	274
c) Federal and State Jurisdiction	275
II. Legal Education	275
1. England	275
a) Between University and Practice: The Historical Development	275
b) University and Practical Phase: Legal Education Today	277
c) Legal Education and Social Justice	278
2. USA	278
a) Law School Education and Bar Exam	278
b) Academic Character of the Best Law Schools	279
c) The Case Method: Some Aspects	280
III. Judges and Lawyers	281
1. England: The Power of Tradition	281
a) Judges Between Tradition and Change	281
aa) The Misleading Classic Picture	281
bb) The Style of Judgments	282
cc) The Way to the Bench	283
b) Barrister and Solicitor	284
aa) Traditional Role Allocation	284
bb) Hesitant Erosion of Differences	285
cc) Queen's Counsel	286
2. USA: The Modern Environment	286
a) Lawyers: Serving the Client	286
b) Judges: The Political Dimension	287
D. The Common Law Process	288
I. Adversarial Process	288
1. Classic Form	288
2. Critique and Change	290
3. Adversarial vs. Inquisitorial Process?	291
II. Jury	292
1. Fact-Finding and Law-Finding Function of the Jury	292
2. Historical Development of the Jury	293
3. The Jury Between Free Decision and Legal Entrenchment	295
a) Decision Without Reasons	295
b) The Jury Instructions	296
c) Possibility of Legal Review	296
d) Jury Equity	298
4. The Jury: Rooted in its Legal Context	298
E. Typical Aspects of Substantive Law	300
I. Statutory Interpretation	301
1. Statutory Interpretation as a Central, Controversial Problem	301
2. Classic Rules of Interpretation	301
3. Doubtful Use of Legislative History	303
4. The Otherness of Common Law Statutory Interpretation	304
II. Real Property	305
1. Feudal Roots of Language and Thinking	305
2. Modern Aspects of Real Estate Law	308

3. Formalistic Structure	309
4. The Embarrassing Rule Against Perpetuities	310
III. Trust	312
1. Basic Idea of the Trust	312
2. Flexibility of the Trust	313
3. Fictional Trusts as a Pragmatic Tool	313
IV. Consideration	314
1. Consideration and Form	314
2. Complexities and Contradictions	315
3. The Opponent: Promissory Estoppel	317
V. Public Law and Private Law	319
1. The Lack of Administrative Law as a Myth	319
2. Historical Background: Star Chamber, <i>Dicey, Laissez-Faire</i> ...	320
3. The Otherness of Administrative Law Under Common Law	322
a) Private Law Elements and the Lack of Administrative Courts	322
b) Substantive Peculiarities	324
VI. Balancing Civil Rights: Levels of Scrutiny	325
1. Rational Basis, Strict Scrutiny, Intermediate Scrutiny	325
2. Prediction of Outcome by Standard of Review	327
VII. Judicial Review of Statutory Interpretation by Agencies	329
1. The <i>Chevron</i> Test	329
2. Openness of the <i>Chevron</i> Test	331
F. English or American?—Marked Contextual Differences	333
I. Substantive and Institutional Differences	334
1. Differences in Substantive Law and Their Importance	334
2. Institutional and Procedural Differences	335
3. Differences Based on Federal Structure	336
II. In Particular: Constitutional Law	338
1. Prominent Role of American Constitutional Law	338
2. Constitutional Law in England?	338
a) Significance and Existence of English Constitutional Law	338
b) Sovereignty of Parliament in Retreat	341
III. England Under European Influence	342
IV. Jurisprudential Basis: U.S. Legal Realism	344
1. "We Are All Realists Now"	344
2. Lack of Importance in England	347
G. Common Law in the Rest of the World	348
I. Between Anglo and American: The Continuum of Common Law	348
II. Some Former Colonies	349
1. Canada	349
2. Australia	351
3. New Zealand	353
III. And Scotland...?	354

Chapter 6. The Basic Context of Civil Law 359

A. Civil Law as a Unitary Context?	359
B. Legal Thinking in Civil Law	361
I. Where Does the Law Come From?—Sources of Law	361
1. Pre-Eminent Role of Statutes	361
a) Positivist Attitude	362
b) Statute, Law, and Democracy	363
c) No Mechanistic Concept of Statutory Law	365
d) Varying Notions of "Statute"	366
2. The Insignificant Rest	367
a) Customary Law	367

b) Further Sources of Law	369
3. And the Judge?	371
II. Law as a System	374
1. The Idea of Codification	374
a) Are Codes Typical for Civil Law?	374
b) What Is a Code?	375
c) Different Concepts of Code	376
aa) Differentiation According to the Degree of Reform	376
bb) Differentiation Between Civil Law and Common Law Codes	378
d) The Structure of a Code: Two Examples	380
aa) France and the <i>Code Civil</i>	380
bb) Germany and the BGB	381
cc) The Language of BGB and <i>Code Civil</i>	383
2. Systematization and Conceptualization	385
a) Unification of Concepts	385
b) General Part, Abstract Mindset, Conceptual Pyramids	386
c) Mental Barriers, Quick Grasp, Language of Statutes	388
3. French Pragmatism	390
a) Similarities from an Outside Perspective	390
b) Differences from an Inside Perspective	391
III. Statutory Interpretation	392
1. The Aim of Interpretation: Objective and Subjective Theories	392
2. Methods of Interpretation	394
a) The Classical Canon of Interpretation	394
b) Methodological Problems and Repercussions	398
b) Practitioners' Nonchalance	400
3. <i>Begriffsjurisprudenz</i> and Its Successors	401
4. French Parallels	404
a) Similar Content, Different Terminology	404
b) The Classical Debate: <i>Ecole de l'Exégèse</i> vs. <i>Libre Recherche Scientifique</i>	404
c) Today's Reality: Methodological Variety	406
aa) Oscillating Methodology	406
bb) Additional Methods of Interpretation and Practical Approaches	407
IV. Applying the Law in Practice	409
1. Law and Fact	409
2. Subsumption	412
a) Basic Structure of Subsumption	412
b) Academic Controversies and Subsumption	414
c) Subsumption as a General Way of Thinking	414
d) Definitions as Distilled Legal Knowledge	416
3. The Legal Opinion Technique	417
a) How to Use the Legal Opinion Technique: An Overview	417
b) Legal Opinion Technique as a General Way of Thinking	418
c) Fixed Templates as Distilled Legal Knowledge	419
d) Formative and Practical Impact of the Legal Opinion Technique	420
4. The Technique of <i>Relation</i>	421
a) How to Write a <i>Relation</i>	421
b) Importance of Thinking in Terms of a <i>Relation</i>	423
5. France: Similar Mindset, Different Realization	424
a) Syllogism	424
b) Pragmatic Solution Instead of Subsumption and Legal Opinion Techniques	425
c) <i>Qualification</i> as Interface Between Law and Facts	427
V. Legal Authorities	429
1. Judicial Decisions	429

a) No Binding Precedent	429
b) Style of Judgments	432
aa) France	432
bb) Germany	434
2. The Role of Legal Literature	437
a) Types of Literature: Commentary, Treatise, Journal . . .	437
b) Influence of the Literature	441
VI. Historical Development	444
1. France	444
a) Customary Law and Roman Law	444
b) Genesis of the <i>Code civil</i>	446
c) Particularities and Critique of the Original <i>Code civil</i>	446
d) Other Napoleonic Codes	448
2. Germany	449
a) The Fragmentation of German Law	449
b) The Controversy over Codification	450
aa) Early Codifications	450
bb) Thibaut vs. Savigny	451
cc) Historical School, Germanists, and Pandectists	453
c) The Creation of the BGB	454
d) Further Codifications	457
C. Courts and Jurists	457
I. Court Structure	457
1. Germany	457
a) Court Branches	457
b) First Instance, Appeal, <i>Revision</i> : Administrative Courts as an Example	458
c) Special Features of Civil and Criminal Procedure	460
d) The Federal Constitutional Court	461
2. France	463
a) Courts	463
b) Appeal and <i>cassation</i>	464
c) Court Hierarchy in Ordinary Courts	465
aa) Civil Procedure	465
bb) Criminal Procedure	466
d) Court Hierarchy in Administrative Procedure	467
e) Constitutional Jurisdiction	469
aa) The Conseil d'État as a Constitutional Court?	469
bb) The Conseil Constitutionnel	470
II. Legal Education	471
1. Germany: The "Uniform Jurist"	471
a) Course of Studies	471
b) Importance of Grades	472
c) Content and Form of Studies	473
d) Private Tutoring	474
e) Practical Education: The <i>Referendariat</i>	474
f) Critique of Legal Education	475
2. France: Education in Stages	476
a) Course of Studies	476
b) Content of Studies and Significance	477
III. Judges and Attorneys	478
1. Germany: The Direct Start	478
a) Judges: Career and Reputation	478
b) Attorneys and Notaries	480
2. France: Specialized Training and Recruitment	480
a) Training of Judges and the <i>Concours</i>	481
b) Training of Attorneys and the Unification of Legal Careers	482

IV. Judicial Procedure	483
1. Courts of First Instance as a Role Model	483
2. Some Typical Features of German Civil Actions	484
a) Paramount Role of the Judge	484
b) Settlement	485
c) Principle of Evidentiary Control and Evidentiary Proceedings	485
d) Costs	486
3. Administrative and Criminal Actions	487
a) Administrative Actions and Examination <i>ex Officio</i>	487
b) Special Features of Criminal Actions, and the Deal	487
4. The French Investigating Judge	490
D. Typical Legal Institutions	492
I. The German Principle of Abstraction	492
II. The French <i>Cause</i>	494
1. Basic Idea of the <i>Cause</i>	494
2. What is the <i>Cause</i> ?	495
3. Functions and Critique of the <i>Cause</i>	496
III. Good Faith	497
1. Practical Results of Good Faith	497
2. Good Faith as an Invitation to Judicial Law-Making	498
IV. The Elements of a Criminal Offense: Constituent Elements, Unlawfulness, and Culpability	499
1. Basic Template and Application	499
2. Theoretical and Practical Significance	500
V. Judicial Review of Administrative Acts	501
1. Differentiation Between Discretion and Indeterminate Legal Concepts	502
2. Independent Judicial Review of Indeterminate Legal Concepts	502
3. Limited Judicial Review of Discretion	503
VI. Human Dignity	505
1. Basic Idea of Human Dignity	505
2. Profound Implications of Human Dignity	505
3. Concrete Normative Content of Human Dignity	507
VII. Limits of Basic Rights: Proportionality	509
1. Area of Protection, Infringement, Limits	509
2. The Structure of Proportionality	510
3. Far-Reaching Significance of Proportionality	511
VIII. Constitutional Complaint and Concrete Judicial Review	512
1. Scope of Constitutional Complaints	512
2. Constitutional Complaints and the Status of the Federal Constitutional Court	513
3. Constitutional Law and General Law: A Difficult Differentiation	514
4. Interaction with Concrete Judicial Review	515
 Chapter 7. Variety of the Civil Law Context	 517
A. The Rough Categorization of Other Western European Countries	517
I. Austria and Switzerland	517
1. German Context—With Reservations	517
2. Austrian Constitutional Culture: Fragmentation, Flexibility, and <i>Hans Kelsen</i>	518
3. Swiss Constitutional Culture: <i>Volksrechte</i> , Federalism, Concordance	521
II. Spain	524
1. Proximity to French Private Law: Historical Background and Present Limits	524
2. Declining French Influence in Administrative and Criminal Law	526
3. The German Model in Constitutional Law	527

a) Similarities with German Constitutional Law	527
b) The Independence of Spanish Constitutional Law	528
4. In Particular: Statutes of Autonomy and Monarchy	531
B. Eastern Europe: Differentiations After Transformation	533
I. The Simplistic Image of Transformation	534
II. The Complex Reality of Transformation	535
1. Repeated Transformations	536
2. Hastily Drafted Statutes	536
3. Remnants of "Socialist" Thinking	538
4. Difficulties in the Application of Law	539
a) Exaggerated Formalism	539
b) Leadership and Flinching from Decisions	541
c) Problems in Implementing the Law	541
d) Initial and Continuing Legal Education	542
5. The Influence of Old Elites	542
6. Legal Nihilism	544
7. Legal Literature and Law in Action	545
III. Three Groups Within the Eastern European Context	546
1. Russia as an Independent Context	546
a) Russian Legal Nihilism and its Consequences	547
b) Self-Image and "Russian Values"	549
c) The Russian Context in Other Countries	550
2. The Eastern EU Member States: The European Prospect	551
3. Eastern European Countries Outside the EU: Slow Development	553
C. Scandinavia: Nordic Legal Thinking	554
I. Historical Background	554
1. Of Marriage and Divorce: Building States in Scandinavia	554
2. External Legal Influences	556
3. The Welfare State	557
II. Special Features of the Scandinavian Context	558
1. Lack of Codification	558
2. Legal Sources	559
3. Scandinavian Cooperation	562
a) Meeting of Nordic Jurists and the Nordic Council	562
b) Common Linguistic Ground	563
c) Decreasing Significance of Scandinavian Cooperation	564
4. Distinctive Characteristics of Nordic Jurists and Nordic Legal Thought	565
a) The Advantage of Small Numbers	565
b) Scandinavian Pragmatism: <i>Lagom</i>	565
5. Reluctant Litigators?	566
III. Specific Legal Institutions	567
1. The Ombudsman	568
a) Variety of Ombudsmen	568
b) The Basic Model of the Swedish Justice Ombudsman	569
c) Ombudsman and Oversight of the Administration	570
2. Principle of Open Government	571
3. Constitutional Law	574
a) Limited Importance of Constitutional Law	574
b) Influence of the Welfare State and Modern Contrary Tendencies	575
c) Weak Judicial Review of Laws	576
IV. Scandinavian Legal Realism	577
1. Scandinavian Legal Realism as a Philosophical Project	577
a) A Difficult Topic	577
b) A Tentative Approach	578
aa) Rights as Mystical Concepts	578

bb) The Struggle Against Natural Law	580
2. Practical Significance Today?	581
3. Relationship with U.S. Legal Realism	583
V. Scandinavia as Part of the Civil Law Context	584
D. Beyond Europe: Latin America	585
I. Latin America as Part of the Civil Law Context	585
1. Similarities and Differences in Context	585
2. Early Pioneers: 19th Century Codifications	586
3. External Influences	589
4. Modified Views	590
a) A Spanish-Portuguese Legal Family?	590
b) Decreasing Importance of Codification?	590
II. Constitutional Law and Latin American Self-Image	591
1. France and Europe as Historical Models	592
2. Independent Development	592
3. The End of Military Dictatorships: A Change of Paradigm	593
a) All Generations of Fundamental Rights	594
b) Judicial Enforcement of Fundamental Rights	595
III. "Obeying, but Not Following": The Reality of Law	597
1. Law in Action vs. Law in Books	597
a) Basic Attitude	597
b) An Example: "Constitutional Poetry"	598
c) Example: <i>Barrios</i> and the Informal Sector	600
d) Inefficient Courts	602
2. Deficient Compliance: Historical, Political, and Social Backgrounds	603
IV. Legal Pluralism: The Ascent of Indian Rights and Indian Law	605
1. Colonization—Assimilation—Integration—Pluralism	606
2. Indian Rights and the Degree of Their Recognition	608
3. Evaluation and Enforcement of Protection	611
4. The Significance of Indian Law	613
a) Constitutional Protection of Indian Law: Problems and Limits	613
b) Resistance in Practice	615
c) Substantive Content of Indian Law	616
aa) Comprehensive and Flexible Character of Indian Law	616
bb) The Example of <i>Az Mapu</i>	617
E. Convergence of Civil Law and Common Law?	619
I. The Fundamental Dispute About Convergence	619
1. Convergence Is Obvious	619
2. Convergence Does Not Exist	621
3. An Overrated Debate	621
II. The Variety of Convergence Hypotheses	622
1. A Question of Perspective	622
2. Convergence from an Historical Perspective	623
3. Convergence from a European Perspective	625
4. Convergence of Specific Legal Rules and Fields of Law	626
5. Convergence of Legal Contexts	629
 Chapter 8. The Context of African Law	 631
A. Plurality as the Hallmark of African Law	631
B. State Law	632
I. Outward Appearances	632
1. Common Law and Civil Law in Africa	632
a) Colonization and Independence	632
b) A Special Case: South Africa	633
c) Current Influence of Parent Legal Orders	634

2. Influence of Islamic Law	635
3. African Cooperation: OHADA	636
II. Problems of Practical Effectiveness	637
1. Failure of the Legal System	637
2. Background	639
a) Democratic Culture and the State in Africa	639
b) Working Environment and Quality of the Judiciary	639
C. Traditional Law	641
I. A Functioning Law and Legal Awareness	641
II. Concepts of Traditional Law	641
III. Development of Traditional Law: An Overview	643
1. Basic Character of Traditional Law	643
a) An Oral Law	644
b) Creating Traditional Law	644
c) Adaptability and Controversial Content	645
d) Simplicity and Complexity	646
e) Inequalities	646
f) Legal Asymmetries	647
g) Dispute Resolution	647
2. Tribal Law in Colonial Times and After Independence	648
3. Renaissance of Traditional Law	650
IV. Typical Contents of Traditional Law	651
1. <i>Ubuntu</i>	651
2. <i>Imbizo</i>	653
3. Marriage and Dowry	654
4. Procedural Aspects	657
5. Excursus: Witchcraft	657
a) Widespread Belief in Witchcraft	657
b) Witchcraft and Criminal Law	659
c) Importance of Superstition in General	661
V. Traditional Law Between Urban and Rural Areas, Majority and Elites	661
1. Multilayered and Complex Distribution in Society	661
2. In Particular: Traditional Law in Urban Areas	663
VI. Integration of Traditional Law into the State	664
1. Degrees of Recognition	664
a) Basic Governmental Attitudes Toward Traditional Law	664
b) A Typical Problem: Traditional Criminal Law	665
c) Recognition of Traditional Dispute Resolution	666
2. State Influence on Traditional Law	667
3. Traditional Law and Modern Human Rights	669
a) An Unsolvable Conflict of Principles?	669
b) Example: Equal Rights in Inheritance	672

Chapter 9. Contexts in Asia 675

A. Asia's Variety	675
I. What is Asia?	675
II. Forming Groups—Open to Development	676
B. China: The Ruling Party	678
I. Historical Development of Chinese Law	678
1. The Era of Traditional Chinese Law	678
a) Confucianism and Legalism	679
aa) Confucian Ethics	679
bb) <i>Li</i> Trumps <i>Fa</i>	680
cc) <i>Fa</i> Instead of <i>Li</i> : The Legalist Alternative	681

b) The Development of Imperial Law Between Confucianism and Legalism	682
aa) The Integration of <i>Li</i> into <i>Fa</i>	682
bb) The Tang Code: A Sophisticated Culture of Legislation and Commentaries	683
c) Important Aspects of Traditional Chinese Law	686
aa) Lack of Private Law	686
bb) Reduced Governmental Law Enforcement	686
cc) Judges as Administrators	687
2. The Time of Western Reforms	688
a) Opium Wars, Unequal Treaties, and Law Reform	688
b) Revolution in Legal Thinking	690
c) Effectiveness of Reforms	691
3. Communist Rule Under <i>Mao</i>	691
a) The Early Years: From Acceptance to Rejection of Law	691
b) The Cultural Revolution	693
4. China After <i>Mao</i>	694
II. Superficial Legal Structures: An Overview	696
1. Government Structure	696
2. Court System	697
3. Sources of Law	698
4. Ties to Civil Law Thinking	699
III. Deeper Legal Structures	700
1. Party and State	700
a) The Party as Primary Power	700
b) Parallel and Interconnected Structures in Party and State	703
2. Beyond State Legislation	704
a) Political Norms	704
b) Party Norms	705
c) Areas of Weak Normativity	706
3. Socialist Foundations	707
4. Centralized Statutory Interpretation	708
a) Interpretive Authority of the Supreme People's Court	708
b) Functional and Practical Doubts	710
5. Dependence of the Judiciary	711
a) Dependence of Judges	711
b) Dependence of Courts	712
c) Autonomy of the Judiciary	712
6. Influence of Traditional Chinese Thinking?	713
a) Destruction of Cultural Traditions	713
b) No Integration of Legal Traditions	715
7. Multiple Levels of Authority in Urban and Rural Areas	716
8. Corruption	717
9. Trust in Alternative Mechanisms?	718
a) Forms and Empirical Importance of Alternative Dispute Resolution	718
b) Alternative Dispute Resolution and Chinese National Character	720
IV. The Long March Toward Rule of Law?	721
1. Two Basic Positions	721
2. <i>Fazhi</i> vs. <i>Fazhi</i> : The Linguistic Basis	722
3. What Is It All About?—The Concept of Rule of Law	724
a) Simple and Ambitious Concepts of Rule of Law	724
b) Rule of Law or <i>Rechtsstaat</i> ?	724
c) Positive Connotation of Rule of Law	726
4. Sequencing	726
5. Hope Remains ...	727

C. Japan, Taiwan, South Korea: The Southeast Asian Way on a Civil Law Basis	728
I. Independence of the Southeast Asian Context	728
II. Historical Westernization of Law	729
1. Decisive Influence of Continental European Law	729
a) Japan: Breaking with Legal Tradition	729
aa) Traditional Japanese Law in Historical Context	729
bb) Modernization and the Meiji Constitution	730
cc) Renewal in Criminal and Private Law	731
b) Taiwan: Continuity in Change	733
c) Korea: Annexation and After-Effects	733
aa) China's Early Influence	733
bb) Japanese Annexation	734
cc) The German turn after independence	734
2. After World War II: Influence of U.S. Law	736
a) Lack of Importance in Korea	736
b) Some Influence in Taiwan	737
c) Tensions in Japan	737
d) Significance of Legal Education and General Legal Thinking	739
III. Confucianism and the Reluctant Litigator	740
1. Cultural and Political Background	740
2. Debates About the Reluctant Litigator: The Focus on Japan	741
3. Empirical Evidence: Judicial Caseloads	743
IV. Some Southeast Asian Characteristics	745
1. Traditional Values	745
2. Weighing of Interests	747
3. Legal Education	747
V. Constitutional Law Attitudes	749
1. The Development of Democracy from Dictatorial Roots	749
2. Powerful Constitutional Courts	749
3. Civil Rights vs. Conservative Traditions	750
4. Social Change and Legal Awareness	751
5. Between Western Influence and Southeast Asian Characteristics	751
D. India: Common Law and Hinduism	752
I. Indian Law Between Reality and Romanticism	752
II. Indian Common Law	753
1. Historical Development	753
a) Presidency Towns and <i>Mofussil</i>	753
b) The Codification Movement	754
2. Common Law Thinking in Legislation and Adjudication	755
3. The Importance of Law in India	757
a) The Reputation of Jurists	758
b) The Pugnacious Supreme Court	759
aa) Who Is Master of the Constitution?	759
bb) Parliament and Supreme Court Today	761
cc) The Supreme Court as Legislator	761
c) Difficulties of Law in India	762
aa) Law and Social Inequalities	762
bb) Law and Social Change	762
cc) Reactions: Legal Aid and Public Interest Litigation	764
dd) Inefficiency of the Courts	765
4. Religious Family Law Today	766
a) Codified Personal Statute	766
b) Customary Law and Judicial Decisions	767
c) Remnant of Traditional Law: Joint Family	767
d) Hindu Family Law as Subsidiary Personal Statute	768

III. Traditional Hindu Law	769
1. <i>Dharma, Vedas, and Smritis</i>	769
2. <i>Sadachar</i>	770
3. Commentaries, Digests, and Legal Schools	771
4. Caste System: <i>Varna</i> and <i>Jati</i>	772
5. The Faded Potential	773
E. Indonesia: Pluralism in a Multiethnic State	773
I. History: The Variety of Influences	774
1. Pre-Colonial Times: The Laws of Java	774
2. Colonial Times: Dutch Rule	775
3. Independence: The Long Way to Democracy	776
II. Indonesian Law Today	777
1. State Law in the Context of Civil Law	777
2. <i>Adat</i>	778
a) Content of <i>Adat</i> Laws	778
b) <i>Adat</i> Between Tradition and Modernity	778
3. Islam	780
a) Islamic Law Under State Influence	780
b) The Fight About the Seven Words	782
III. Law's Difficult Position	783
1. Contradictions and Uncertainties in State Law	783
2. Inefficiency of the Courts	784
3. Corruption	785
 Chapter 10. The Context of Islamic Law	 789
A. Classical Islamic Law: The Fundamentals	789
I. Divine Revelation and Human Elaboration	789
II. On Words: Islamic Law, <i>Sharia</i> , <i>Fiqh</i>	791
III. Legal Sources in Sunni Islam: <i>Usul al-Fiqh</i>	792
1. The Divine Foundation: The Koran	792
2. The Life of the Prophet: Sunna and the <i>Hadiths</i>	793
3. Consensus (<i>Ijma</i>)	796
4. Analogy (<i>Qiyas</i>)	797
5. General Welfare (<i>Istihsan</i>)	798
6. Continued Existence (<i>Istihab</i>) as a Rule of Evidence	799
7. Integration of External Law, Esp. Customary Law (<i>Urf</i>)	799
8. Other Secondary Sources	799
9. Interaction Between Sources and with <i>Tafsir</i>	800
IV. The Classical Schools of Islam	801
1. The Four Schools of Sunni Islam	802
a) Hanafites	802
b) Malikites	802
c) Shafites	803
d) Hanbalites	803
2. Shiite Islam	803
a) The Shiite Secession	803
b) The Jafari School	804
V. Islam and Change: <i>Ijtihad</i> Today	806
1. The Classical Opinion: The Door Is Closed	806
2. What Is <i>Ijtihad</i> ?	807
3. The End of <i>Ijtihad</i> : Consequences	808
4. The Opponents' View: The Door Is Open	809
a) Nobody Has Closed the Door	809
b) Hanbalites and Shiites as Classical Opponents	809
c) Modern <i>Ijtihad</i>	810

aa) Reformists and Modernists	810
bb) Critical Reassessment	811
d) Eclectic Critique and Imaginary Law	812
5. Change Without <i>Ijtihad</i>	813
VI. The Judiciary in Islam	813
1. "Kadi Justice"	813
2. Tasks and Role of the Kadi	814
3. Qualifications of the Kadi	815
4. Procedural Law	816
5. The Mufti as Legal Expert	816
6. Manuals for Legal Practice	817
B. The Contents of Islamic Law (<i>Fiqh</i>)	818
I. The Five Categories of Legal Consequences	818
1. Legal, Moral, and Religious Aspects of the Categories	818
2. <i>Wajib</i> and <i>Fard</i> : The Obligatory	819
3. <i>Haram</i> : The Forbidden	819
4. <i>Mandub</i> , <i>Makruh</i> , and <i>Mubah</i> as Intermediate Categories	820
5. Complex Implications	820
II. Aspects of Family and Inheritance Law	821
1. Dowry (<i>Mahr</i>)	821
2. Shiite Temporary Marriage (<i>Mut'a</i>)	821
3. Divorce (<i>Talaq</i>)	822
4. Polygamy	823
5. Wives' and Daughters' Share of Inheritance	825
III. Criminal Law	826
1. From <i>Hadd</i> to <i>Tazir</i> : The Narrow Field of Application	826
2. Restricting Severe <i>Hadd</i> Punishments: The Example of Theft	826
3. Filling the Gaps Through State Law: <i>Tazir</i>	828
4. The Critique of Islamic Criminal Law	828
a) Criticism Based on Western and Human Rights Values	828
b) Islamic Defense	828
c) Islamic Reform in Theory and Practice	830
5. Tendencies Towards a Fundamentalist Re-Islamization	830
6. Apostasy as an Instrument of Control	832
IV. Islamic Finance and Banking	833
1. A Promise of Justice	833
2. Prohibition of Interest, and Possible Evasions	834
3. Example: Islamic Credit Agreements	835
4. Sharia Conformity: Certification and Risk	835
C. Islamic Law in Modern Countries	836
I. Colonial Imprints	836
II. Legislation According to Traditional Islamic Law: <i>Siyasa</i> and <i>Qanun</i>	838
III. Strict Implementation of Islamic Law in the State: Saudi Arabia	839
1. Wahhabism	839
2. Koran and Sunna as Applicable Law	840
3. Position of State Legislation	841
IV. Primacy of State Law Between Self-Assertion and Retreat	841
1. The Many Ways of Islamic Law	841
2. Islamic Family and Inheritance Law: Codification and Reform	842
3. Islamic Law as Inspiration for Legislators and Judges	844
4. Islamic Law of Higher Rank	846
a) Integration of Islamic Law into the Constitution	846
b) Legal and Practical Significance of Contradiction Clauses and Source Clauses	847
c) Which Islamic Law?	849

d) The Example of Egypt	850
e) Islamization of the Constitution?	851
D. Excursus: Other Religious Laws	852
I. Jewish Law: The Power of Debate	852
1. A Layered Model of Law	853
a) Torah and <i>Mishnah</i>	853
b) Talmud	853
c) Post-Talmudic Sources: Commentaries and Codifications	855
2. Bound by God, Changed by Men: The Schools	855
3. Jewish Law and State Law	856
4. Specific Features of Jewish Law	857
5. For Example: The Rejection of Polygamy	858
6. Jewish Law in Israel	859
II. Canon Law: The Slow Retreat	861
1. Historical Importance	861
2. Relationship Between Canon Law and State Law	862
3. Divine Law and Human Law	862
4. Church Law Today	864
5. Canon Law in Comparison	865
 Chapter 11. Contexts of Transnational Law	 869
A. Comparative Law Beyond the State	869
B. The Context of Public International Law	870
I. Classic Links Between Public International Law and Comparative Law	870
II. Public International Law as an Object of Comparative Law	872
III. Specific Features of the Public International Law Context	874
1. Political Influence and Lack of Centralization	874
2. Sources: Consensual Lawmaking and "Soft Law"	874
3. Limited Legal Personality for Individuals	876
4. Indirect Law Enforcement	876
5. Processes of Constitutionalization and Differentiation	878
6. Independence from Civil Law and Common Law Contexts	879
C. The Context of European Union Law	879
I. EU Law in Comparative Perspective: Between Familiar Ground and New Frontiers	879
II. In Search of a Context of EU Law	881
1. The Debate About a European Legal Culture	881
2. EU Law and National Contexts	882
3. Pluralism of EU Law	884
III. Some Specific Traits of Supranational EU Law	885
1. Perspectives of European Policy: Of Romantics, Skeptics, and Technicians	885
2. Federal Dovetailing	887
3. Democratic Deficit, Institutional Balance, Market	888
4. The European Court of Justice: Apodictic Motor of Integration	889
5. Vast Expanses: Substantive EU Law	890
IV. Beyond EU Law	892
D. The Context of <i>Lex Mercatoria</i> ?	893
I. <i>Lex Mercatoria</i> : The Law of International Economic Relations	893
II. Existence and Content of <i>Lex Mercatoria</i> : The Fundamental Debate	894
1. <i>Lex Mercatoria</i> as a Legal Order: Theoretical and Practical Problems	894
2. The Multitude of Theories on <i>Lex Mercatoria</i>	896
III. <i>Lex Mercatoria</i> and Comparative Law	896
 Index	 899