

Maja Sahadžić

Asymmetry, Multinationalism and Constitutional Law

Managing Legitimacy and Stability
in Federalist States



Comparative Constitutional Change

ROUTLEDGE 

สำนักหอสมุด มหาวิทยาลัยเชียงใหม่

Asymmetry, Multinationalism and Constitutional Law

Managing Legitimacy and Stability
in Federalist States

Maja Sahadžić

61672396X

012585075

122706331



 **Routledge**
Taylor & Francis Group
LONDON AND NEW YORK

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
1 Inception	1
<i>Constitutional asymmetry: an old topic with a few gaps to fill</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Basis of reasoning</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>Empirical and qualitative approaches</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>Definitions and terminology</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>Outline</i>	<i>7</i>
2 A theoretical framework about constitutional asymmetry in multi-tiered multinational systems	10
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>The starting point: symmetry in traditional federal systems</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>The turning point: asymmetry in multi-tiered multinational systems</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Linking constitutional asymmetry and multi-tiered multinational systems</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>The first dimension: constitutional asymmetry</i>	<i>16</i>
Defining asymmetry	16
De facto asymmetries	19
<i>Variations in size of territory and population</i>	<i>19</i>
<i>Differences in identity</i>	<i>22</i>
<i>Variations in wealth</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>Political parties</i>	<i>27</i>
De iure asymmetries	28
<i>Status of sub-national entities</i>	<i>32</i>
<i>Distribution of powers and competences</i>	<i>37</i>
<i>Fiscal autonomy</i>	<i>41</i>
Summary of the types of constitutional asymmetries	42
Linking constitutional asymmetry and multi-tiered multinational systems	43

The second dimension: multi-tiered systems 44

Defining a multi-tiered system 44

Horizontal and vertical interaction between tiers 46

How do multi-tiered systems build on the dynamic notion of federalism? 47

Linking multi-tiered systems with constitutional asymmetry 50

Multi-tiered systems as a context for multinationalism 52

The third dimension: multinationalism 52

Defining multinationalism 52

Linking multinationalism to multi-tiered systems and constitutional asymmetry 54

Accommodating multinationalism in multi-tiered systems 55

Multinationalism and constitutional asymmetry 59

Merging multinationalism with multi-tiered multinational systems 62

Conclusions of the chapter 63

3 Analyzing the link between constitutional asymmetry and multi-tiered multinational systems 73

Introduction 73

Properties of a multi-tiered (multinational) system:

identifying target populations 73

Properties and sub-properties 73

Limitations to the properties 74

Unit of analysis 74

Application of the properties 74

Primary target population 75

Secondary target population 75

Indicators of constitutional asymmetry 76

Identifying the indicators 76

The first indicator: distinct status of a sub-national entity 76

The second indicator: the distribution of powers and competences 77

The third indicator: fiscal autonomy 78

Index of indicators 78

Qualified respondent's questionnaire 80

Developing and applying the questionnaire 80

Collection of the data 80

Dataset 81

Country studies 81

Reporting results 82

Variance between the primary and secondary target population 82

Variance within the primary target population 82

Variance within the secondary target population	82
Discussion on the link between constitutional asymmetry and multi-tiered multinational systems	83
Is there a higher frequency of constitutional asymmetry in multi-tiered systems that are multinational than in those that are not?	83
How strong is the link?	83
General trends in constitutional asymmetries	84
Overall range of constitutional asymmetries	84
Range of constitutional asymmetries per category	86
Range based on the types of sub-national entities	88
Identifying the congruent features of constitutional asymmetries	88
<i>Crisp-set qualitative comparative analysis for better understanding of the interaction between constitutional asymmetries and congruent factors</i>	88
Truth table	88
Constitutional asymmetries in status	89
Constitutional asymmetries in powers and competences	92
Constitutional asymmetries in fiscal autonomy	93
Which factors does multinationalism interact with when triggering constitutional asymmetries?	95
<i>Conclusions of the chapter</i>	95
4 A conceptual approach to dynamic legitimacy and stability	99
<i>Introduction</i>	99
<i>Legitimacy: traditional and contemporary</i>	99
Concept of legitimacy: classical	99
Concept of legitimacy: a new frame of reference in contemporary dynamics	101
<i>Legitimacy in multi-tiered multinational systems with asymmetrical features</i>	104
Search for legitimacy in two divisions	104
First division: territorial and multinational origins of legitimacy	104
Second division: horizontal and vertical origins of legitimacy	105
Blending two divisions	106
An input, output, and throughput search for legitimacy	107
Input and output legitimacy	107
<i>Input side in multi-tiered multinational systems with asymmetrical features</i>	108
<i>Output side in multi-tiered multinational systems with asymmetrical features</i>	113
Throughput legitimacy	121
<i>Throughput side in multi-tiered multinational systems with asymmetrical features</i>	121

Epilogue to the contemporary frame of reference	125
<i>Multilateral and mutual legitimacy: Willy Wonka's elevator as an inspiration</i>	127
<i>Stability: traditional and contemporary</i>	130
Concept of stability under the traditional terms of reference	131
Concept of stability under new-fangled dynamics	132
Generalizability of contemporary research	132
Duplexity of arguments split into three elements	133
<i>Stability in multi-tiered multinational systems with asymmetrical features</i>	135
Territorial and multinational (im)balances	135
Horizontal and vertical (im)balances between and among tiers	138
Structural and fiscal (im)balances	141
Structural (im)balances	142
<i>Status</i>	143
<i>Division of powers and competences</i>	145
<i>Political party system as a congruent feature</i>	149
Fiscal (im)balances	152
<i>Fiscal autonomy</i>	153
<i>Wealth as a congruent feature</i>	156
Prologue to the finale	158
<i>Adaptiveness, trust, and coordination: a search for dynamic stability</i>	161
<i>Conclusions of the chapter</i>	166
5 Constitutional asymmetry vs. legitimacy and stability	179
<i>Introduction</i>	179
<i>Equality</i>	180
A few introductory remarks	180
Concept of equality defined	180
Concept of equality: predicaments for hardships	182
Introducing constitutional asymmetry to equality and <i>vice versa</i>	183
Distinct status of sub-national entities vs. equality	184
Distribution of powers and competences vs. equality	190
Fiscal autonomy vs. equality	194
<i>Transparency</i>	196
A few opening remarks	196
The concept of transparency defined	197
Concept of transparency: a congruence of concepts	198
Complexity	200
Accountability	201

Transparency against the indicators of constitutional
 asymmetry 202
 Distinct status of sub-national entities vs. transparency 203
 Distribution of powers and competences vs. transparency 208
 Transparency vs. fiscal autonomy 212

Cohesion 215

A few preliminary remarks 215
 Concept of cohesion defined 216
 Territorial and social cohesion 217
 Territorial cohesion 217
 Social cohesion 220
 Political cohesion 223
 Institutional cohesion 225
 Cohesion meets the indicators of
 constitutional asymmetry 226
 Distinct status of sub-national entities vs. cohesion 226
 Distribution of powers and competences vs. cohesion 231
 Fiscal autonomy vs. cohesion 234

Conclusions of the chapter 236

6 Conclusions 254

Appendices 257

Appendix 1 257
Appendix 2 259
Appendix 3 262

Index 265