

Peace or Democracy?

Peacebuilding Dilemmas to Transition from Civil Wars

Izabela Pereira Watts

Foreword by José Ramos-Horta





b 16704587 0 12576645 i 22685054

PEACE OR DEMOCRACY?

Peacebuilding Dilemmas to Transition from Civil Wars



Izabela Pereira Watts

Foreword by José Ramos-Horta



CONTENTS

Preface	xi
Acknowledgments	xii
Foreword	$x\nu$
List of peace operations	xvii
List of illustrations	xx
Glossary of abbreviations and technical terms	xxii
About the author	xxvi
Introduction	1
I.1 Concept foundations 5	
I.2 The objective 9	
I.3 Justification: why do peacebuilding, democratization, civil wars, and fragile states matter? 12	
I.4 A note on global peace data: is the world becoming more or less peaceful? 16	
I.5 A note on postwar democratization: democratic peace theory and sequential transition models 19	
I.6 Book structure 24	
I.7 Methodology: research design 25	
I.8 Definitions: what are we talking about? 29	
I.9 Overview of the chapters 33	
Notes 37	
References 37	

PAF	RTI	
	nsitional dilemmas, violent democracies, and the United tions's statecraft	45
1	The transition from civil war to hybrid peace: 14 dilemmas of peace, democracy, and state-building in post-conflict societies	47
	 1.1 Transition from hybrid war to hybrid liberal peace: background approach 48 1.2 Theoretical foundation: transitional dilemmas 51 1.3 Dilemmas and trade-offs between efforts to promote peace or democracy: an advanced approach 52 1.4 Premises of the Philosophical—Actors—Tactical (P—A—T) framework of transitional post-conflict and peacebuilding dilemmas: its properties and limitations 60 1.5 Summary of the chapter 63 References 66 	
2	United Nations hybrid liberal peace dilemmas: Contingent sovereignty, responsibility to protect and moral selectiveness	68
	 2.1 United Nations's statecraft: "benign" autocracy versus autonomy 2.2 Westphalia versus post-Westphalia peace: legality, legitimacy, sovereignty, and R2P 72 2.3 Who deserves to be free and safe? Selectiveness, efficiency, and other dilemmas 78 2.4 Summary of the chapter 83 	69
	Note 84 References 84	
3	From guns to votes to doves: Violent transition with ballots and bullets	89
	 3.1 U curves and "violent democracy": anocracies, civil wars, and fragile states 91 3.2 Dilemmas of violence in democratic civil peace transitions: causes and consequences of why violence breeds violence 95 3.2.1 Dimension of actors 97 3.2.2 Security dimension 98 3.2.3 Institutional dimension 102 3.3 Summary of the chapter 110 Notes 110 References 111 	

4	What role do UN operations play in bringing	\$10
	simultaneously peace and democracy to post-civil war countries?	114
	 4.1 Methodology 116 4.2 Analysis of promoting the state, democracy, and peace in post-conflict societies 121 4.2.1 Postwar democratic civil peace through UN peacekeeping operations 121 4.2.2 Autonomous postwar democratic civil peace: cases without UN intervention 124 	
	 4.3 Addressing the role of UN peacekeeping operations in promoting the state, democracy, and peace with the P–A–T framework of dilemmas: why are there different results? 131 4.3.1 The United Nations as savior: why do some missions triumph with the "positive but modest approach"? 131 4.3.2 Relying on the United Nations: why do some missions fail? 132 4.3.3 Not so peaceful nor so democratic: why are some countries stuck in the middle? 134 4.3.4 Action for Peacekeeping: is the answer for more effective operations? 137 4.4 Summary of the chapter 138 	
	Notes 139	
	References 144	
AE	RT II	
	nsitions to political, legal, civil, and social orders	149
5	From war to peace: When elections and political parties promote democracy?	153
	 5.1 Elections: from the battlefield of war to the ballot box battlefield 15 5.2 Elections in dangerous place: more dilemmas than solutions 155 5.3 Demilitarization of politics and democratization of warlords: victorious guerrilla fighters turned democratic rulers 163 5.3.1 Literature review: transforming warring armies into political parties 165 5.3.2 Dilemmas of transforming warring armies into political parties 168 5.4 Summary of the chapter 176 Notes 177 References 178 	52

6	When the pen fails, the sword rules: Constitution building and power-sharing for divided societies	182
	 6.1 Conceptualization of sharing power and constitutionalism: division, competition, and institutional arrangements 183 6.1.1 Constitutional reform and dual power-sharing: the alternative of semi-presidentialism as cohabitation of power 6.1.2 Risks of constitutional reform: balance and alternation of power in democracy- building 189 6.2 Consociational democracy and power-sharing: alternatives for shared rule, self-rule, and the "tyranny of the majority" 191 6.2.1 Power-sharing arrangements and five case studies: good or bad for democracy and peacebuilding? 193 6.2.2 Additional power-sharing arrangements: peaceful alternatives but not so democratic 197 6.2.3 Power-sharing in Kosovo: consensus, consociational democracy, or no democracy at all? 200 6.2.4 Summing up power-sharing dilemmas: positive peace and negative democracy 202 Notes 204 References 207 	186
	No Justice, (no) peace?: Democratic injustice or undemocratic justice in the name of human rights and reconciliation	210
9	 7.1 Human rights: would amnesty ensure peace and democracy? 211 7.2 Justice matters: Truth and reconciliation commission and ad hoc tribunals 215 7.3 Leges inter arma silent: in the limbo between traditional and legal justice systems 219 7.4 Summary of the chapter 225 Notes 226 References 227 	
8 3	Silencing the guns through DDR and SSR: The securitization of peace or governance of insecure democracy?	229
	8.1 What do we know about DDR and SSR? 230 8.2 Trusting the enemy: dilemmas of post-conflict securitization and governance 237 8.2.1 Good timing for DDR/SSR: cost, sequencing, ownership, and other dilemmas 242 8.2.2 A note on the privatization of peace: more problems than	

 8.3 A case study on the security sector of Central African Republic: worse than a failure 245 8.4 A case study on the security sector of Timor-Leste: a partial or no reform? 249 8.5 Summary of the chapter 249 Notes 255 References 255 	***
9 From war to peace: Voters but not yet citizens	258
 9.1 Civil society: the people's voice on human rights and the parallel state 259 9.1.1 Dilemmas on how to go from civil strife to civil society in disrupted states: politicized and "uncivil" agents 262 9.2 Media reform and freedom of speech: (un)peaceful, (not) free and (un)fair 267 9.3 Summary of the chapter 270 Note 271 References 271 	
PART III	
Conclusion and recommendations	275
From hybrid democratic peace toward an integrated transition: Conclusion, limitations, and recommendations	277
Appendix Index	283 309